People-centred approaches to coral reef management:
Lessons learned at CERMES, UWI Cave Hill Campus

Maria Pena and Patrick McConney

Presented at:
U.S. Coral Reef Task Force Meeting
St. Thomas, U.S. Virgin Islands
27 October 2006
People-centred

- People will usually want coral reef management to succeed … *awareness*
- People are often not sure what to do to manage coral reefs … *information*
- People lack critical skills to be effective, even if they know what to do … *capacity*
  
  ... we suggest *learning-by-doing* (participatory applied research)
Approaches

• Interdisciplinary research
• Graduate students, faculty
• With local project partners
• ICM, fisheries, biodiversity

• Capacity building
• Strategic planning
• Livelihoods analysis
• Coastal co-management*
• Socio-economic monitoring*
• Fisheries planning for MPA*
• MPA management effectiveness*
Coastal co-management

Coastal Resources Co-management Project (CORECOMP)

• **Purpose:**
  – Governance reform through coastal resources co-management

• **Coral reef sites:**
  – **Belize**
    • Gladden Spit & Silk Cayes Marine Reserve
    • Laughing Bird Caye National Park
    • Sapodilla Cayes Marine Reserve
  – **Grenadines**
    • Tobago Cays Marine Park

• **Partners:**
  – **Belize**
    • Friends of Nature
    • TASTE
  – **Grenadines**
    • TCMP office
Situation analysis

- Belize
  - Reefs heavily used for fisheries and tourism
  - Reef management is a major national concern
  - Formal co-management agreements between government and NGOs
  - MPA managed by NGO
  - Limited local capacities
  - Many external agencies

- Grenadines
  - Reefs heavily used for fisheries and tourism
  - Reef management is a minor national concern
  - No co-management yet
  - Much conflict between government and NGOs
  - MPA managed by govt.
  - Limited local capacities
  - Few external agencies
Coastal co-management
Belize and the Grenadines

Objectives:

– Capacity building and institutional strengthening of major co-management partners
– Co-management pilot projects
– Strategies, processes and policies for co-management
Coastal co-management

Belize and the Grenadines

Results

• Capacity building workshops on
  – Co-management
  – Proposal writing
  – Strategic planning
  – MPA management
  – Socio-economics
• MPA management board retreat
• Policy briefs on co-management
• Forum for conflict management
• Better inter-agency communication
• Strengthened NGO/CBO leadership
• Understand conditions for success
Coastal co-management

Belize and the Grenadines: Lessons learned

**Good**
- NGO and CBO stakeholders favour collaborative and delegated co-management
- Policy frameworks exist
- Shared views on resource problems and solutions
- Willingness to learn

**Bad**
- Government and civil society stakeholders lack capacity
- Governments are often weak co-management partners, but reluctant to relinquish power
- Many conditions that favour success are absent or weak in the Caribbean region
Socio-economic monitoring

Socio-economic Monitoring for Caribbean Coastal Management (SocMon Caribbean)

Purpose:
- Help coastal managers better understand the communities whose activities affect, and are affected by, coastal management decisions.
- Use socio-economic information to minimize the negative impacts of management decisions, demonstrate the value of coastal resources and incorporate community concerns into decision-making.

Site: Negril Marine Park, Jamaica

Partner leader: Negril Coral Reef Preservation Society (NCRPS)
Situation analysis

- Impacts of unsustainable development
  - Land-based pollution (agriculture, tourism)
  - Decline in the health of habitats
  - Decline in abundance of desirable species
- Reef Check monitoring initiated in 2003
- Coastal zone management not effective
- Coastal poverty and high unemployment
- Entire households believed vulnerable
Socio-economic monitoring

Methods:
- Secondary data
- Key informants
- Household and individual surveys
- Validation workshops

Jamaica
Socio-economic monitoring

Jamaica

Results

- Training in socio-economic monitoring
- Better inter-agency communication
- Information on demographics, use of resources, infrastructure, attitudes, household assets, livelihoods, etc.
- Plans for monitoring and management

Figure 4.7: Perception of people’s influence on management

Figure 4.18: Amount of tourism in NMP

Figure 4.19: Amount of fishing in NMP
Socio-economic monitoring

Jamaica: Lessons learned

**Good**
- Participatory management favours including socio-economic monitoring info
- Capacity exists for monitoring
- SocMon method feasible for Caribbean situations

**Bad**
- Few time series of socio-economic information
- Inadequate links between information and decisions
- Capacity to fully utilise data and information very uneven among stakeholders
Fisheries planning for MPA

Negril Marine Park
Fisheries Management Plan

Purpose:
- Describe the fisheries, their status and threats; the socioeconomic status and the activities of the stakeholders; as well as the approach and programmes to be undertaken in order to manage the site for conservation of the resources and sustainable development in the area

Site: Negril Marine Park, Jamaica
Partner: Negril Coral Reef Preservation Society (NCRPS)
Jamaica national situation

Outdated fisheries laws
Inadequate fisheries policy
Few management plans

National consultations

Draft fisheries policy
Draft fisheries laws
Strategy for planning

DEVELOPMENT OF A POLICY FRAMEWORK AND STRATEGIC PLAN FOR SUSTAINABLE FISHERIES IN JAMAICA
Local situation analysis

- No pro-active management of fisheries in the NMP
- Few detailed surveys of the fishery resources
- Sparse commercial fish landing data
- Low levels of fish abundance with very few large fish
- Small sizes of few commercially important species
- Fisheries and MPA policy not fully implemented
- Fisheries livelihoods may not be sustainable
Fisheries planning for MPA

Methods:

- Secondary data analysis
- Community consultations
- Household and individual questionnaire surveys
- Validation workshops
- Collaborative writing teams

Jamaica
Fisheries planning for MPA
Jamaica

Results

- Capacity building workshops on
  - NGO Board effectiveness
  - MPA co-management
  - Draft fisheries policy
  - Fisheries management
- Understand MPA co-management
- Information exchange with fishers
- Appreciating poverty, livelihoods
- Networking with social partners
- First test of draft fisheries policy
- First MPA to draft a fisheries plan
  (still very much a work in progress)
Fisheries planning for MPA

Jamaica: Lessons learned

**Good**
- Government pursuing a livelihoods approach to fisheries management
- MPA and fisheries managers work well together in the field
- Fishers, despite hard times, are interested in managing and alternative livelihoods

**Bad**
- Poverty and limited economic opportunities constrain viable fishery management options
- Fisheries authority has little capacity to manage in NMP
- Conflicts between fisheries and tourism are likely to increase with overfishing
Management effectiveness

Enhancing management: How is your MPA doing?

Purpose:
- To conduct participatory management effectiveness research and evaluations by training at least 30 people at three MPAs.
- To improve MPAs in the region by monitoring outcomes in lessons learned training and communication materials for coursework, research, management and coastal policy.

Sites:
- Negril Marine Park (NMP)
- Tobago Cays Marine Park (TCMP)
- Sapodilla Cayes Marine Reserve (SCMR)

Partners:
- NCRPS
- TCMP office
- TASTE
Situation analysis

- Reefs vary in condition from good to bad
- Different types of tourism and impacts
- None to elaborate management plans
- Struggling with financing for operations
- Keen NGOs associated with management
- Not much used to evaluating effectiveness
Management effectiveness

How is your MPA doing?: Belize, Jamaica, Grenadines

Methods

– Inception site-specific training workshops in MPA management effectiveness and evaluation
– Participatory management effectiveness research and evaluations at the three MPAs
– A terminal joint workshop on lessons learned and the consequent adaptation of management
– Production of training materials based on process experiences and on lessons learned

Too soon to report results
**Management effectiveness**

Belize, Jamaica, Grenadines: Lessons learned

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Good</th>
<th>Bad</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Appreciate importance of evaluating management</td>
<td>• Poor links between plan objectives and activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Have reasonable capacity to conduct in-house evaluations</td>
<td>• Weak agency culture of evaluating management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Willingness to learn, to adapt and to improve management</td>
<td>• Lack of systems to assess some bio-physical indicators</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Key lessons and challenges

• Socio-economic monitoring, along with strategic planning, helps people map their relationships to resources and each other.
• To implement plans, some form of co-management is often sought.
• Issues:
  – power and other inequities,
  – inadequate capacity at many levels
  – policies that do not enable self-organisation and adaptation
Key lessons and challenges

• Management plans that incorporate livelihoods perspectives need to be tested
• Pay attention to the *process* of MPA management effectiveness evaluation along with the *product* of the evaluation
• Critical to build and sustain the capacity to learn collectively and adapt management
Caribbean collaboration

• Collaboratively design and implement participatory projects for learning-by-doing

• Use multi-stakeholder networks for widely sharing outputs and outcomes

• Invest in people-centred approaches to improve marine resource governance
http://www.cavehill.uwi.edu/cermes/

Thank you for your attention

Visit our web site for more information